

CHRISTOPHER P. STATILE, P.A.

PROFESSIONAL ENGINEERS AND PLANNERS
DESIGN CONSULTANTS

CPSTATILE@AOL.COM

3 FIR COURT
OAKLAND, NJ 07436
(201) 337-7470
FAX: (201) 337-7599

NEW YORK, NY

September 22, 2021

Chairman Scott Lippert
and Members of the Joint Land Use Board
Township of River Vale
406 Rivervale Road
River Vale, NJ 07675

Regarding: **Block 1201, Lot 6.01 Township of River Vale
Including Block 2001, Lot 1 and Block 2201, Lots 26 & 31, Borough of Hillsdale
Preliminary & Final Major Site Plan with Variances
Major Soil Moving Application
Applicant & Owner: Edgewood Golf Course Realty Associates, LLC**

Dear Chairman Lippert and Members of the Board:

We are in receipt of an application submitted to the Township on August 30, 2021 for Preliminary & Final Major Site Plan with variances and Major Soil Moving. In addition to the application, the applicant submitted engineering and architectural plans, as well as other supplemental materials.

The engineering plans are prepared by Partner Engineering and Science Inc. and consist of 23 sheets dated February 10, 2021 and revised to August 6, 2021 as follows:

- Sheet 1 of 23, entitled "Title Sheet"
- Sheet 2 of 23, entitled, "Preliminary & Final Major Site Plan"
- Sheet 3 of 23, entitled, "Existing Conditions and Removals Plan"
- Sheet 4 of 23, entitled, "Overall Site Plan"
- Sheet 5 of 23, entitled, "Site Plan"
- Sheet 6 of 23, entitled, "Site Plan"
- Sheet 7 of 23, entitled, "Site Plan"
- Sheet 8 of 23, entitled, "Site Plan"
- Sheet 9 of 23, entitled, "Overall Grading Plan"
- Sheet 10 of 23, entitled, "Grading Plan"
- Sheet 11 of 23, entitled, "Grading Plan"
- Sheet 12 of 23, entitled, "Grading Plan"
- Sheet 13 of 23, entitled, "Grading Plan"
- Sheet 14 of 23, entitled, "Utility Plan"
- Sheet 15 of 23, entitled, "Profiles"
- Sheet 16 of 23, entitled, "Vehicle Route Plan"
- Sheet 17 of 23, entitled, "Construction Details"
- Sheet 18 of 23, entitled, "Construction Details"
- Sheets 19 through 22 of 23, entitled, "Soil Erosion & Sediment Control Plan"
- Sheet 23 of 23, entitled, "Soil Erosion & Sediment Control Details"

The following other documents were also submitted:

- A report entitled, "Supplemental Stormwater Management Report," prepared by Partner Engineering and Sciences, Inc. and dated February 10, 2021.
- Landscape Plans prepared by Melillo Bauer Carman Landscape Architecture, consisting of seven sheets dated August 6, 2021.
- Architectural Plans prepared by JGA Architecture, consisting of nine sheets dated June 25, 2020.
- Tennis Dome Architecture plans consisting of two sheets prepared by Arizon Building Systems and dated August 24, 2021.

The applicant has applied for Preliminary and Final Site Plan approval for the following improvements:

- Demolition of the existing midway building.
- Construction of a new midway building & putting green.
- Enhancements to the existing pool and patio area, and new snack building.
- Construction of two new tennis courts.
- Construction of a seasonal dome over the existing tennis courts.
- Modifications to three holes at the existing golf course
- Removal of a piped section of the Rivervale Brook and restoration of a natural channel.

General Site Description

The subject property is located in both River Vale and the Borough of Hillsdale. The site consists of 142.277 acres with frontage on Rivervale Road. The property surrounds the Fairways housing development, which is presently under construction. The Board approved the Residential/Golf Course Development, which includes 249 residential units on the Fairways property and the 18-hole golf course and other amenities on the subject property, as memorialized in a resolution adopted on June 27, 2019.

The site is presently improved with the Edgewood Country Club, including an 18-hole golf course, clubhouse, pool, tennis courts, and other related amenities and improvements. The subject properties are located in an A-1 Zone District, in which a Residential/Golf Course Development is a permitted conditional use. The property contains freshwater wetlands, and a riparian buffer to the Holdrum Brook along the western portion of the golf course which divides the property into Hillsdale Brook along the western portion of the golf course, which divides the property into Hillsdale Borough. Rivervale Road is a County road under jurisdiction of the County Planning Board.

Development Proposal

The subject application only addresses Lot 6.01, which contains the golf course/country club, and associated improvements. The present application does not impact any of the residential development. Also, all improvements are proposed in River Vale Township (part of the course is located in Hillsdale).

The applicant proposes the following specific improvements on Lot 6.01:

1. Proposed seasonal dome to enclose four tennis courts located approximately 17 ft. from the Rivervale Road front lot line, near the Old Tappan Road intersection. The dome measures 216 ft. x 121 ft. and would seasonally cover four tennis courts. The tennis dome has a proposed height of 37 ft. and two stories. These are generally internally illuminated at night and air-supported structures.
2. "Reconstructed" tennis courts, measuring approximately 110 ft. x 122 ft. The tennis courts are located *approximately* 15 ft. from the Rivervale Road front lot line, and north of the proposed seasonal tennis court dome location. A 10 ft. high fence will surround the reconstructed tennis courts. Since it is currently a grassed area of the property, the use of "reconstructed" must be clarified.
3. Revisions to the existing golf course, including multiple new greens, holes, sand traps, tee holes and bunkers:

Hole No. 1 is being shifted eastward closer to residential properties, and removing forested areas along the Riverdale Brook. A new back tee box is being added.

Hole No. 2 is being lengthened with new tee boxes and a green, and moved northward along Patriot Way. Again this place the hole closer to residential properties along the opposite side of Patriot Way.

Hole No. 3 is being shifted eastward with new tee boxes and green, placing it closer to the rear yards of dwellings on Forest Court.

Hole No. 8 includes a new tee boxes lengthening the hole new the new Midway Building.

Hole No. 10 includes a new back tee box by the relocated Midway Building.

A new practice putting green behind the new Midway Building.

4. Removal of the existing Midway Building and construction of a new Midway Building. The new building will be located south of the prior midway building, and will contain 7,110 SF on the lower level, 13,619 SF on the main level, and 7,047 SF on the upper level. The proposed building height is 23 ft per architectural plans but the Bulk Table variance #2 shows height of 33 ft.

The new building includes staff space, storage, maintenance and electrical space, laundry and linen facilities and kitchen support on the lower level; golf simulator areas, dining space, kitchen, reception areas and ancillary uses on the main level; multi-purpose rooms, kitchen space and office on the upper level. The main level dining area would include 34 seats for private dining, 136 indoor member seats, and an outdoor terraces with 56 seats and 32 covered seats.

The building includes a parking lot expansion for 15 spaces, and a large soil berm to shield it from the new townhouses.

5. Various site improvements around the pool including a new larger snack house. These should be part of the site plan approval.
6. Sanitary sewer, gas, electric, and domestic and fire protection water extensions to the Midway Building. A new hydrant is also proposed in the parking area.
7. Stormwater collection from new Midway Building connected to the new detention system for the townhouses.
8. Sidewalk connection from the new townhouses to the new Midway Building.
9. Realignment/channelization of a pond on the Holdrum Brook in the western portion of the site.

The proposed improvements require Major Site Plan approval with bulk variances. The uses are all permitted but do not conform to the bulk standards.

Completeness Review

We reviewed the application for completeness against the requirements for Preliminary & Final Site Plan and Major Preliminary Subdivision on Schedule A & Schedule B. The following items are deficient:

1. LOI or Letter of Exemption from NJDEP. The project requires several NJDEP permit approvals that have been issued in 2021:

Flood Hazard Area Individual Permit (IP)
Freshwater Wetlands Transition Area Waiver – Special Activity Redevelopment
Freshwater Wetlands Transition Area Waiver Averaging Plan

The Board is not bound by the permits under the Site Plan Review i.e. if the site plan changes, the applicant must return to the NJDEP to modify their permits. The risk is on the applicant in getting permits before Board approvals.

2. Photographs of the premises in question. To be provided prior to the public hearing, labeled and numbered. Sufficient copies to be provided for distribution to the Board.
3. Natural Resources Information.
4. Any section for which a waiver is being requested.

The application materials are complete and the application is ready to be scheduled for a public hearing.

Zoning Analysis

The submitted plans include a bulk table. It appears that the following bulk variances are required assuming the main banquet hall/swimming pool is the principal use:

1. **142-224A(1)(d)(10), Accessory Building Height:** Midway Building Height - 23 ft. and 2 stories per architectural drawings vs. 25 ft. and one-story permitted maximum (the Bulk Table conflicts with the Architectural plan).
2. **142-224A(1)(d)(10), Accessory Building Height:** Tennis Dome Height - 37 ft. and 2 stories drawings vs. 25 ft. and one-story permitted maximum.
3. **142-224A(1)(d)(12), Accessory Building Setback:** Tennis Dome – 17.58 ft. setback proposed vs. 25 ft. minimum required, a difference of 7.42 ft.
4. **142-225C(1), Accessory Building Size:** Tennis Dome – 26,136 SF proposed vs. 600 SF maximum permitted, a difference of 25,536 SF.
5. **142-225C(1), Accessory Building Size:** Midway Building – 13,750 SF proposed vs. 600 SF maximum permitted, a difference of 13,150 SF.
6. **142-225E, Accessory Building Location:** Tennis Dome proposed in front yard setback area.
7. **142-225C:** No more than three accessory buildings per lot.
8. **142-267:** Tennis Court proposed in front yard setback area (No setback distance provide to front property line).

General Comments

1. We assume the legal notice will include the area surrounding the townhouse tract since its stormwater management system is part of the subject application.
2. The applicant should provide testimony on the size of the existing midway building and the reason for its removal and replacement.
3. The "Reconstructed" tennis courts along Rivervale Road must include stormwater capture and controls. The courts are only 10 ft. from the property line and public sidewalk/bikeway. Issues of clay laden runoff, winter icing, etc. may plague the sidewalk/bike path. This may require a westerly relocation of the courts.
4. There are existing stormwater runoff issues onto the sidewalk opposite the crosswalk at Old Tappan Road. These must be resolved in conjunction with the new impervious dome. The existing stormwater controls are not effective.
5. The applicant should explain the need for the tennis dome covering which requires variances due to height and location. The existing court is clay and has caused clay to be washed onto the lower public sidewalk in the past. The seasonal dome will mitigate that issue.

Seasonal domes generally include interior lighting and their exterior luminous is defined by the material thickness being used. Such dome would give the golf course a commercial look from the road. Its hours of operation should be discussed and what months the dome is to be used for.

6. While expansion and relocation of the course holes is proposed, an explanation should be provided given as it will affect nearby residents and clearing of wooded areas within the Riparian Zone of the Rivervale Brook.

The NJDEP has permitting jurisdiction over the 300 ft. wide riparian zones, the delineated flood hazard areas, freshwater wetlands and wetlands buffers. However, the Board can discuss the necessity of the disturbances and its effect on the Township's environment.

7. The applicant must provide the number of trees proposed for removal and replacement under the current tree restitution ordinance. Only indigenous replacement trees are counted towards restitution. Given current substandard issues with replacement trees for the affordable housing building, replacement trees and pines must strictly meet caliper requirements.

All shrubs are to be measured at their planted height. A note must be added to the landscaping plans to avoid misunderstandings during construction.

8. Is a grease interceptor proposed for the new Midway Building? The Public Works Department has had grease buildup issues with the sewer in Rivervale Road just below the Country Club this year.
9. The existing stormwater management system previously approved for the townhouses is being used to accept additional impervious coverage of the new buildings and parking area. That system is not functioning as designed. The developer is attempting to resolve the issues. o

The golf country club must legally integrate its uses with the townhouse stormwater management system since they are separate entities, or may become separate in the future. The determination of future maintenance of the systems must be integrated into the stormwater maintenance plan required by the NJDEP.

10. It appears that some flood fringe storage is being lost with the re-channelization of the Holdrum Brook (waters within the floodway are not considered storage). The applicant should describe where the storage volume is being compensated on site.
11. With the relocation of the three holes and greens we recommend that evergreen landscaped buffers be provided to visually separate these features from residential properties. In the fall when trees are defoliated, golf play continues until the ground freezes.
12. The existing chain link fence along Patriot/Green Lanes should be considered for replacement due to its condition and age.

Additional comments may be forthcoming.

Very truly yours,

C. P. STATILE, P.A.


Christopher P. Statile, P.E.
Planning Board Engineer

CPS/mr

cc: Marc Liebman, Esq., Joint Planning Board Attorney
Peter Wolfson, Esq., Attorney for the Fairways at Edgewood, LLC, Applicant
Steven Varneckas, P.E., Woodmont Properties, Director of Development, Applicant
Daphne Galvin, P.E., Site Engineer
Eric Timsak, P.P., Bergen County Planning Board
Maria Haag, Joint Planning Board Deputy Secretary
3100.052/Site Plans/Fairways at Edgewood/PB Reports/September 2021 Application